



**Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes**

November 21, 2023

Members Present: Sharon D. White, Chair
Al Fullenkamp
Sharon Hairston
John A. Lumpkin, Jr.
Belinda Matthews-Stenson
Thomas Weckesser
David P. Williamson

Excused: Nikol Miller
Grady Mullins

Staff in Attendance: Bob Ruzinsky
Daron Brown
Roland Caldwell
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall
Deborah Howard
Brandon Policicchio
Shawn Prince
Mary K. Stanforth

Ms. White called the meeting to order at 8:32 a.m. and roll call was taken:

Roll Call

Ms. White -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	Excused
Mr. Mullins -	Excused
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of October 17, 2023 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes

Ms. White asked if attendees request a reading of the minutes or have corrections to the minutes?

Upon hearing no requests or corrections, a MOTION was made by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston to APPROVE the October 17, 2023 minutes.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Board Action Items

Action Item #2 – Ultra Low Sulfur Diesel Fuel

Mr. Brown explained the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) uses #2 Ultra Low Sulfur (ULS) fuel daily for the diesel bus fleet and RTA’s non-revenue diesel vehicles.

This procurement supports the core values of Quality Service and good Stewardship of RTA’s financial resources by ensuring that diesel fuel is available for service and is purchased at a fair and reasonable price.

Vendors were required to base their bids on the Daily OPIS (Oil Price Information Service) Gross #2 Ultra Low Sulfur Distillate Price, Dayton, Ohio, Rack Average plus or minus (+/-) a fixed differential. The differential determines the lowest bidder.

Sealed bids for the purchase of #2 Ultra Low Sulfur diesel fuel for a one-year period with two one-year option years were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly*, and *Transit Talent.com*. Invitations for Bid were sent to 47 vendors.

At 2:00 p.m. on October 26, 2023, eight (8) bids were received and publicly opened. The results were as follows:

VENDOR	Floating Price Differential (Cents/Gallon) (OPIS) BASE CONTRACT YEAR	Floating Price Differential (Cents/Gallon) (OPIS) OPTION YR. 1	Floating Price Differential (Cents/Gallon) (OPIS) OPTION YR. 2
World Fuel Services, Inc. Miami, FL	-0.0754	No Bid	No Bid
Sunoco, LLC Fort Wayne, IN	-0.0563	-0.0546	-0.0527
Indigo Energy Partners, LLC Gainesville, GA	-0.0550	-0.0525	-0.0450
Petroleum Traders Corporation Fort Wayne, IN	-0.0486	-0.0486	-0.0461
Mansfield Oil Company of Gainesville Gainesville, GA	-0.0441	-0.0275	-0.0250
Duncan Oil Company* Beavercreek, OH	0.00	No Bid	No Bid
Colonial Oil Industries, Inc Savannah, GA	+0.0013	+0.0063	+0.0113
PS Energy Group, Inc.* Dunwoody, GA	+0.00835	+0.00835	+0.00835

*Nonresponsive

Based on the OPIS floating price for #2 Ultra Low Sulfur Fuel for October 26, 2023, and the differential bid by World Fuel Services, Inc., the estimated annual cost is as follows.
(1/1/24 – 12/31/24)

Est. Annual Qty. in Gallons	OPIS Floating Price per Gal for 10/26/23	Differential Cents/Gal	Price per Gal before Taxes	Federal Environmental Recovery Fee \$/Gal	Ohio Motor Fuel State Tax \$/Gal	Federal Excise Tax (LUST) \$/Gal	*Current Ohio Diesel Petroleum Activity Tax (PAT) \$/Gal	Fed. Haz. Substance Superfund Recovery Fee \$/Gal	Total Cost per Gallon	Total Annual Estimated Cost
1,200,000	3.0689	-.0754	2.9935	.002143	.47	.001	.016790	.003905	3.4873	4,184,760

*The Ohio Petroleum Activity Tax changes quarterly based on the statewide average wholesale price of a gallon of diesel fuel, as reported by the Tax Commissioner.

Funding for this procurement is included in the operating budget.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees an AWARD to World Fuel Services, Inc. for #2 Ultra Low Sulfur Diesel Fuel with a differential of $-.0754$ on the OPIS for an estimated award amount of \$4,184,760. Actual costs will vary based on the daily OPIS price, the number of gallons purchased, and quarterly adjustments made to the Ohio Petroleum Activity Tax. The total dollar amount will not exceed the annual budgeted amount in the operating budget.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #3 – Wi-Fi Installation

Mr. Prince stated the purpose of this procurement is to select a firm to partner with RTA for the removal of old hardware and the installation of new network hardware in the 600 and 601 Longworth Buildings, 901 Ludlow, and Wright Stop Plaza.

The installation includes mounting all access points and related hardware, supplying and certifying cables, installing all wireless mounting brackets, and all labor necessary to remove old hardware and cabling. This purchase supports RTA’s core value of Stewardship by effectively using agency resources.

Proposals for the Wi-Fi Installation were solicited through *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*.

Requests for Proposals were sent to 13 firms.

At 10:00 a.m., on October 18, 2023, two (2) proposals were received as follows:

Gudenkauf LLC
Columbus, OH

N-Ovation Technology Group, LLC
Dayton, OH

The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine the most qualified and reasonably priced using the following criteria:

- Qualifications and Experience
- References
- Reasonableness of Cost
- Quality of Proposal

The firm ranked the highest by the Evaluation Committee was N-Ovation Technology Group, LLC. The pricing received is as follows:

DESCRIPTION	N-OVATION	GUDENKAUF
Labor for Installation Total	\$ 70,125	*
Labor for Removal Total	6,500	*
Material Total	59,100	*
Total Amount	\$135,725	*

MOTION made by Mr. Weckesser and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to N-Ovation Technology Group, LLC, in the amount of \$135,725 for Wi-Fi Installation.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 6-0-1 with Mr. Lumpkin abstaining from the vote.

Action Item #4 – Ticket Vending Machines

Mr. Policicchio stated the purpose of this procurement is for RTA to purchase two large footprint Ticket Vending Machines (TVMs) for use at Wright Stop Plaza (WSP) and four small footprint TVMs for use at the four RTA Transit Centers (Northwest, South, Eastown, and Westown). The TVMs are being replaced because the VenTek TVMs currently in place frequently break down due to cash and smart cards jamming.

RTA proposes purchasing the TVMs through NEORide. The use of NEORide was approved at the June 6, 2023, Board meeting. NEORide was established as a Council of Governments under Ohio law, and one of its purposes is to do joint procurements with NEORide member agencies. These contracts are created through a competitive process and evaluated. The authorized vendor is Parkeon, Inc. doing business as (dba) Flowbird.

This procurement fulfills RTA’s goal of Quality Service as customers and their satisfaction is our highest priority.

Flowbird proposed two models of TVMs. The model that meets RTA’s needs at WSP is referred to as the “Large Footprint Required” TVM and is called the Astreo TVM with the coin system removed (Option 1). Customers will be able to pay with bills, contact and contactless credit cards, as well as with credit cards stored in mobile wallets such as Apple Pay and Google Pay. The Astreo has a multi-stock fare media dispenser, and it can dispense both extended use (plastic) and limited use (reinforced paper) contactless smart cards.

The model that meets RTA’s needs at the four Transit Centers is referred to as the “Small Footprint Required” TVM and is called the Strada Touch TVM (Option 2). In this most popular configuration, Customers will be able to pay with bills, coins, contact and contactless credit cards, as well as with credit cards stored in mobile wallets such as Apple Pay and Google Pay. The Strada Touch TVM will dispense limited use contactless smart cards.

The cost for the Flowbird TVMs would be as follows:

Quantity	Description	Unit Cost	Total Cost
	TVM Costs		
LS	Integration Costs with Masabi	\$93,190.50	\$93,190.50
2 each	Large Footprint TVM (option 1)	46,251.74	92,503.48
4 each	Small Footprint TVM (option 2)	16,999.16	67,996.64
LS	Shipping	Included	Included
LS	Spare Components Large Footprint (see attached)	-	*39,754.00
LS	Spare Components Small Footprint (see attached)	-	*15,777.00
LS	Configuration, Installation, & Training Large Footprint	10,950.00	10,950.00
LS	Configuration & Installation Small Footprint	1,600.00	6,400.00
	SUBTOTAL		326,571.62
	Miscellaneous		
2 each	Licenses Large Footprint – 2 nd Year	828.00	1,656.00
2 each	Licenses Large Footprint – 3 rd Year	828.00	1,656.00
2 each	Warranty Large Footprint – 2 nd Year	1,500.00	3,000.00
2 each	Warranty Large Footprint – 3 rd Year	1,650.00	3,300.00
4 each	Licenses Small Footprint – 2 nd Year	732.00	2,928.00
4 each	Licenses Small Footprint – 3 rd Year	732.00	2,928.00
4 each	Warranty Small Footprint – 2 nd Year	445.00	1,780.00
4 each	Warranty Small Footprint – 3 rd Year	489.50	1,958.00
	TOTAL		345,777.62

*Spare component costs are estimated.

MOTION made by Mr. Weckesser and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Parkeon, Inc. dba Flowbird for Ticket Vending Machines in the amount of \$345,778 plus a 20% contingency in the amount of \$69,156 for unforeseen costs for a total amount of \$414,934. This procurement will be funded with 80% Federal funds.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio stated the Customer and Business Development Department update was provided in today's meeting packet. Mr. Policicchio shared that a service change will begin on Sunday, December 31, 2023. He also shared that once again, Santa would be riding the holiday bus on various routes, taking children's Christmas wishes, and handing out candy canes.

September 2023 Financial Report

Ms. Stanforth stated the September 2023 Financial Report was provided in today's meeting packet. Passenger fares are \$1.3 million over budget because of post-pandemic increased ridership. Total revenue is \$1.6 million over budget due to higher passenger fares, interest and sales tax, offset by lower federal assistance. Total expenses are \$743,000 under budget due to lower paid employee absences, fringe benefits, contract services and materials & supplies. Those positive variances are offset by higher employee wages and purchased transportation costs. RTA's service gain is \$104,000 after nine months, which compares to a budgeted loss of \$2.2 million. The overall financial result is tracking favorably compared to budget.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Howard stated the Small Purchasing Information was included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions regarding small purchases.

CEO Update

Mr. Ruzinsky stated the Amalgamated Transit Union Local 1385 has signed the recent union contract.

Next Meeting

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committee meetings are scheduled for January 16 and February 20, 2024.

Adjournment

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser to ADJOURN the meeting.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Ms. White DECLARED the meeting ADJOURNED at 8:50 a.m.

ATTEST



Sharon D. White, Chair * John Lumpkin



Mary K. Stanford, Committee Secretary