

Jointly Held  
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committee  
Meeting Minutes

December 15, 2020

**Members Present**

**Via Teleconference:** John Lumpkin, Jointly Held Committee Chair  
Vince Corrado  
Sharon Hairston  
Adrienne Heard  
Sharon Howard  
Belinda Matthews-Stenson  
Thomas Weckesser  
David P. Williamson

**Staff in Attendance:**

Mark Donaghy  
Julie Beard  
Daron Brown  
Chris Cole  
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall Co., L.P.A. (via teleconference)  
Tim Harrington  
Deborah Howard  
Brandon Policicchio  
Bob Ruzinsky  
Mary K. Stanforth

**Others Attending:**

Various citizens via teleconference

The meeting was called to order at 8:35 a.m. and roll call was taken:

**Roll Call**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

**Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority**

**Approval of November 17, 2020 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes**

Mr. Lumpkin asked if attendees request a reading of the November 17, 2020 meeting minutes or have any corrections to the minutes.

Upon hearing no requests or corrections, MOTION was made by Mr. Corrado and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston to APPROVE the November 17, 2020 jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting minutes.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

**January Board Action Items:**

With regard to all Action Items presented today, each Item is essential to the delivery of transportation services to the public.

**Action Item #2 – Mobile Column Lifts**

Mr. Brown stated the purpose of this procurement is to purchase four (4) sets of mobile column vehicle lifts for use by the HVAC Maintenance Shop for the servicing and inspection of diesel and trolley buses, trucks, and other vehicles. The HVAC Shop, which is currently located within the Trolley Shop will be moved to the 601 building. With the 41 production NexGen trolley buses in service, the Trolley Shop requires the three (3) spaces currently used by the AC Shop for trolley bus maintenance. One additional spot was added to the new AC Shop location in the 601 Building to allow for growth and to be able to work on an additional bus, if necessary. This procurement fulfills the core value of Safety, as we continuously work to maintain our fleets for passenger safety and comfort.

The successful contractor is required to provide equipment delivery and on-site training on the equipment for up to 12 personnel.

Sealed bids were solicited through the Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly News, and Transit Talent. Invitations for bid were sent to seventeen (17) bidders.

At 10:00 a.m. on November 25, 2020, three (3) bids were received and publicly opened. The results of the bid opening are as follows:

Firm		Heavy Lift Systems, Inc. Akron, OH		Ott Equipment Service, Inc.* Noblesville, IN		Technology International, Inc.* Lake Mary, FL	
Item	Qty.	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price
Mobile Column Lifts	4 Sets (4 lifts per set)	\$38,695	\$154,780	\$37,198	\$148,792	\$41,850	\$41,850
Training		No Charge	0	No Charge	0	No Bid	No Bid
<b>TOTAL</b>			\$154,780		\$148,792		\$41,850

\* Non-responsive

This procurement will be partially funded with federal grant funds.

MOTION made by Ms. Heard and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Heavy Lift Systems, Inc. for four (4) Mobile Column Lifts totaling \$154,780, plus a 10% allowance in the amount of \$15,478 for any accessories needed for the lifts, for a total contract award amount of \$170,258.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin - Yes  
 Mr. Corrado - Yes  
 Ms. Hairston - Yes  
 Ms. Heard - Yes  
 Ms. Howard - Yes  
 Ms. Matthews-Stenson - Yes  
 Mr. Weckesser - Yes  
 Mr. Williamson - Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

**Action Item #3 – Bus Stop Enhancement and Shelter Cleaning including Trash Removal**

Mr. Brown stated the purpose of this procurement is to enter into a multi-year contract with a qualified firm to provide professional cleaning services of sheltered bus stops and surrounding areas, including trash removal. These services will be provided at approximately 200 designated sites owned by the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) and located throughout Montgomery County. This project is consistent with RTA’s core values of Quality Service, Safety, and Stewardship by maintaining and improving our environment and facilities. RTA attracts more people and promotes our dedication to customers as we invest in their experience at all RTA locations.

The successful contractor for this procurement is required to provide all labor, equipment, materials, and supplies necessary to provide weekly steam cleaning and trash removal on the days specified for each site and other times as requested. The contractor is responsible for ensuring that

the area surrounding the shelter is clean and free from debris within a 25 feet radius from any edge of the shelter. This procurement is part of RTA's passenger amenities program, ensuring a positive public image.

Proposals were solicited for Bus Stop Enhancement, Shelter Cleaning including Trash Removal through the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Requests for Proposals were sent to 37 firms.

At 2:00 p.m. on November 10, 2020, one (1) proposal was received. The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposal using the following criteria:

- Reasonableness of cost
- Competence of personnel
- Evidence of thorough planning
- Experience relative to this type of project and references
- Type of equipment and supplies to be used
- Quality of proposal preparation

Several companies on the bid list were contacted that didn't submit a proposal to find out why. The answers received back from almost all of them were staffing shortages, and current workloads that they felt would prevent them from taking on the work responsibly. Another company was unable to get its proposal completed before the deadline.

The following firm submitted a proposal:

Firm	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Five Year Total	15% Contingency	Total Amount
Allen Professional Touch Trotwood, OH	\$65,012	67,551	69,583	71,615	74,662	\$348,423	\$52,264	\$400,687

A 15% contingency is being included for emergency calls and additional services added during the contract period.

Funding for this procurement is included in the operating budget.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Corrado that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD for five (5) years to Allen Professional Touch as follows: Year One (1) at \$65,012, Year Two (2) at \$67,551, Year Three (3) at \$69,583, Year Four (4) at \$71,615 and Year Five (5) at \$74,662 for a total of \$348,423 plus a 15% contingency for the base and option years of \$52,264 for a grand total of \$400,687. The actual cost will vary based upon the number of shelters, caps, or trash receptacles added or deleted and the frequency of additional services required.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

**Action Item #4 – Wireless Phone & Data Services and Data Service for Vehicles**

Mr. Harrington stated the purpose of this procurement is to contract with a firm to provide wireless phone services, machine to machine data services, and set up a Virtual Private Network (VPN) tunnel, including professional support services at Greater Dayton RTA. Wireless phones are required to provide cellular communications when personnel are away from the office and those working in the field. Machine to Machine (M2M) data service is required for revenue service vehicles to communicate with the Clever Devices real-time CAD/AVL system and allow for GPS tracking of all non-revenue service vehicles. This procurement is being brought to the Board at this time because the current contract with Verizon Wireless ends December 31, 2020.

The wireless phone/data service supports the core values of Quality Service and Safety by allowing RTA personnel to stay in contact with other personnel and assist customers when needed. The vehicle data service supports our strategic plan for reliability by allowing RTA to keep its customers informed when buses arrive in real-time.

Proposals were solicited in *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Request for Proposals were sent to four (4) firms.

At 2:00 p.m., on November 13, 2020, three (3) proposals were received and reviewed by the Evaluation Committee.

The committee evaluated the proposals based on the following criteria:

- Service Area Coverage
- Cost and Data Usage Limits
- Billing options/Online Account Management
- Cost of Devices
- Quality of Proposal Preparation

There are currently thirty-three (33) smartphone/tablet devices in use by RTA staff. The maintenance department uses seven (7) basic phones in the field. In addition, transportation supervisors have twenty-six (26) tablets for real-time computer aided dispatching (CAD) and email functions as part of the machine to machine (M2M) data service. There are 365 revenue and non-revenue vehicles using cellular data services for CAD and vehicle location. The nine (9) RTA power substations use cellular data services for system control and data acquisition (SCADA).

	<b>AT&amp;T Cincinnati, OH</b>	<b>Verizon Annapolis Junction, MD</b>	<b>T-Mobile Bellevue, WA</b>
	Monthly Rate	Monthly Rate	Monthly Rate
Wireless Phone/Tablet Services	\$7,339.93	*	*

\*FTA procurement regulations require that only the successful proposer's pricing data be disclosed publicly.

AT&T was found to be the most qualified due to coverage in the RTA service area, overall cost, priority planning for first responders, and the other areas evaluated.

Due to the projected need for an increase in the machine to machine (M2M) data usage, new validator equipment for the Tapp Pay System, upgrades, and changes in phone/tablet devices, a contingency is being requested to allow for changes in the plan over the contract period. RTA estimates a need for as many as thirteen (13) additional Smart Phones/Tablets. The estimated cost for purchasing the thirteen (13) new and upgrading the existing thirty-three (33) devices is shown separately from the annual service cost.

Year	Additional Devices	Total Additional Devices	Average Cost	Monthly	Yearly
One	2	2	\$35	\$70	\$840
Two	2	4	35	140	1,680
Three	3	7	35	245	2,940
Op. Yr. 1	3	10	35	350	4,200
Op. Yr. 2	3	13	35	455	5,460
<b>Estimated Phone/Tablet Services Contingency</b>					<b>\$15,120</b>
<b>Estimated Phone/Tablet Device Purchase/Upgrade*</b>					<b>\$15,000</b>

\*The \$15,000 represents the option to purchase additional phones/devices.

A contingency of \$44,404 (10%) growth of M2M data usage is included for future expansions:

- Added functionality to the Clever Devices CAD/AVL system
- Increased data usage on supervisor tablets
- Increased use of the live look-in feature of the Apollo camera system
- Additional equipment monitoring on the power substation SCADA system

	<b>AT&amp;T Wireless Cincinnati, OH</b>
Total Three Base Years (36 months)	\$264,238
Total Two Option Years (24 months)	176,158
Total Five Years	\$440,396
Phone/Tablet Services Contingency	15,120
Contingency for future demands (10%)	44,040
Phone/Tablet Device Purchases/Upgrades	15,000
<b>Grand Total not to Exceed</b>	<b>\$514,556</b>

This procurement is part of the operating budget.

MOTION made by Mr. Weckesser and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to AT&T Wireless for a not to exceed amount of \$264,238 for three base years; an additional \$176,158 for two option years for a five (5) year total of \$440,396; an additional \$59,160 contingency for increases in usage; and \$15,000 for phone/tablet device purchases/upgrades for a grand total not to exceed \$514,556.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

**Customer and Business Development Update**

Mr. Policicchio provided a Customer and Business Development Department update document that included the following highlights:

- Tapp Pay cash-conversion outlets up and running
- NexGen story to be shared in upcoming Mass Transit magazine article
- Holiday bus debut with Santa promoting social distancing & masks on essential trips
- Customer Advocacy Group met to approve new bylaws
- Sharing of Victory Project who helped RTA refurbish Wright Stop Plaza benches
- RTA sponsorship of the Dayton Contemporary Dance Company

**Finance Update**

Year-to-date November 2020 indicates a gain of \$15.5 million after the local capital charge. The gain is primarily due to the funding received from the Federal government as part of the CARES Act. When factoring in Federal and State depreciation the net gain is \$2.6 million. This explanation regarding operating gains has been consistent through much of 2020. RTA will use CARES Act funds to subsidize future operations with the loss of revenue we are facing longer term.

Sales tax received for September 2020 was down \$165,000 from last year and up \$116,000 from current budget. Year-to-date September 2020 receipts are up \$571,000 from last year and \$1.1 million from current budget.

**Small Purchasing Information**

Ms. Howard stated the Small Purchasing Information was previously included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions regarding small purchases.

**Next Meetings**

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meetings will be held on Tuesday, January 19, 2021 and Tuesday, February 16, 2021 at 8:30 a.m.

**Adjournment**

Mr. Lumpkin DECLARED the meeting ADJOURNED at 9:07 a.m.

**Attest**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
John Lumpkin, Chair

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Brandon Policicchio, Committee Secretary