



**Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes**

September 17, 2024

Members Present: Sharon D. White, Chair
Al Fullenkamp
Sharon Hairston
John A. Lumpkin, Jr. (arrived at 8:40a)
Belinda Matthews-Stenson
Grady Mullins
Thomas Weckesser
David P. Williamson

Excused: Nikol Miller

Staff in Attendance: Bob Ruzinsky
Daron Brown
Roland Caldwell
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall
Deborah Howard
Brandon Policicchio
Mary K. Stanforth
Robert Stevens

Ms. White called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. and roll call was taken:

Roll Call

Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin	No
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	Excused
Mr. Mullins -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Ms. White -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of August 20, 2024 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes

Ms. White asked if attendees request a reading of the minutes or have corrections to the minutes?

Upon hearing none, MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp to APPROVE the August 20, 2024 Committees Meeting minutes as presented.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Mr. Lumpkin arrived at the meeting at 8:40 a.m.

Board Action Items

Action Item #2 – Resolution No. 2024-10-1, Authorizing Staff to Seek Federal Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act Flexible Funding to Support Transit Projects

Mr. Ruzinsky stated RTA was notified by the Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission (MVRPC) regarding the solicitation of new transportation projects under the category of Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ). Once submitted, applications for the proposed new projects are to be reviewed and evaluated for possible inclusion in the State Transportation Improvement Program (TIP).

In reviewing the region’s transportation needs, Staff has developed a project that is eligible for flexible funding, and the proposal has been scrutinized in the context of MVRPC practices and policies. The proposed project has a total cost of \$3,750,000 with a Federal Share of \$3,000,000.

Competition for these funds is expected to be substantial; applications are due on October 10, 2024 and require the Board’s approval of the attached resolution that was provided.

MOTION made by Ms. Hairston and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of Resolution No. 2024-10-1, authorizing the submittal of all necessary documents and the fulfillment of all other requirements, in order to obtain additional funding for project(s) approved by the MVRPC.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

Action Item #3 – Remix Transit Planning Software Service

Mr. Policicchio stated the purpose of this procurement is to award a sole source contract to Remix Software Inc. to provide cloud-based transit planning software services to Greater Dayton RTA for a three (3) year period.

Remix’s proprietary web-based transit planning software platform provides rapid route design, import/analysis/modification of existing transit routes, demographic analysis, operating cost calculations, travel time visualizations, demand response service planning, and Title VI analysis into a single integrated platform for transit planning.

Since acquiring Remix, it has enhanced results and reduced contracted service costs. By utilizing the Remix platform, RTA is able to utilize its resources wisely and apply best practices with the delivery of its planning and service development functions. Remix has allowed RTA staff to effectively communicate the benefits of service changes that are often invisible and hard to explain. Through the Remix customer engagement platform, customers and employees are able to visualize and compare current and future travel times as a result of service changes.

Software Capabilities Included with Contract

- Software as a Service: fully hosted, unlimited agency user licenses, a cloud-based web platform that can be accessed from anywhere.
- Dedicated customer service to assist with specific projects, track success criteria, and “Enterprise Support” to respond to requests within one (1) business day.
- Annual subscription with no maintenance fees.
- Regular no-cost automatic updates, improvements, and new feature launches.
- Unlimited file type exports, custom data layers, and General Transit Feed Specification (GTFS) uploads.
- Demand response service analysis.

RTA is anticipating an award based on a three-year period of peak performance for 74 fixed route vehicles at a cost of \$37,410 per year for a total dollar amount of \$112,230. Based on a cost comparison for the current contract, there was a 14.7% reduction in cost for the first year due to the reduction in peak vehicles.

This procurement will be funded with operating funds.

MOTION made by Mr. Weckesser and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Remix Software Inc. for the Remix Transit Planning Software Service for \$37,410 per year, for a three (3) year total of \$112,230.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

Action Item #4 – Printing Services

Mr. Policicchio explained the purpose of this procurement is to select a firm to partner with Greater Dayton RTA for the purchase of first class printed materials that represent the agency’s professionalism and brand standards to the community.

This contract would include a diverse range of printing materials including flyers, brochures, envelopes, and weatherproof signage and posters. In total, there are 42 individual print materials for which RTA requested pricing.

Proposals for Printing Services were solicited through *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Requests for Proposals were sent to 65 firms.

At 10:00 a.m., on August 1, 2024, three (3) proposals were received. The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine the most qualified and reasonably priced using the following criteria:

- Background and Experience
- Quality of Samples Submitted
- Capacity to Perform the Work Specified
- Reasonableness of Cost
- Quality of Proposals

The following firms submitted a proposal:

Proposal Pricing Three (3) Years	Progressive Printers Dayton, OH	Commodity Management Services (CMS) North Canton, OH	Promotional Spring Miamisburg, OH
Total Amount	\$ 267,062	**	**

*FTA requires only the successful Proposer’s pricing to be publicly disclosed.

This project is being funded through the Operating budget.

MOTION made by Mr. Weckesser and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD for three years to Progressive Printers for printing services in the amount of \$267,062.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

Action Item #5 – Intelligent Transit Systems (ITS) Upgrade Project – Phase 1 of 3

Mr. Policicchio explained the purpose of this procurement is to award contracts to our existing Intelligent Transportation System (ITS) solution providers Clever Devices and Trapeze, for the updating of existing platforms that support the operations of Greater Dayton RTA.

ITS components outlined in Phase 1, are targeted for installation and live operations in 2025 and are included in the approved 2024 capital and operating budgets. The total estimated cost of the upgrade, for all three (3) phases, is estimated to be roughly \$7 million. The total cost of the previous upgrade in 2016 for components included in these phases was over \$7 million.

This procurement is part of a three-phase upgrade project that will take place in 2025, 2026, and 2027. Most ITS platforms were last updated in 2016, and are nearing the end of useful life, and some products will no longer be supported beginning in 2026. Due to this, we will be upgrading, replacing, and adding new features to the existing system over the next three (3) years.

It is important to note that due to constant changes in technology, and software security, the useful life of most ITS platforms no longer lasts the life of a typical transit bus (10 to 15 years). Moving forward, we expect the useful life of most ITS software, and some equipment, to last no more than five (5) years. However, we will work with vendors, when available, with options to extend the useful life of equipment and software beyond five (5) years when possible.

Phase 1 System Components

Clever Devices LTD

Fixed Route On-Board Computer System: We will be updating 150 fixed-route vehicles with new on-board computer systems (i.e., IVN5), this includes 11 spare units. Note, 46 existing fixed route vehicles already have the updated system installed. The useful life and support for these existing systems will end in 2026.

Bus-In-A-Box: A single full on-board computer system, which includes other ITS related items for training, testing and troubleshooting, also known as a bus-in-a-box or “BiB.”

Replace EOL URLC3's with URLC4's: We will be updating all 185 fixed route vehicles with the latest radio integration component. This allows the on-board computer to communicate with radio systems. In addition to 15 spare units. The useful life for these existing systems will end in 2026.

Qty	Description	Total Price
150	IVN4 to IVN5 Migration, includes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ IVN5 Controller, Hardware, and other Installation Supplies ▪ Design, Configuration & Testing ▪ Year 1 of Hardware Warranty included at no charge 	\$1,668,300.00
150	Management IVN Upgrade Discount	(\$120,000.00)
1	BIB Model and Hardware	\$31,833.60
1	BiB Design, Build, Configuration, Testing and Project Management	\$13,368.00
1	BiB Setup and Final On-Site	\$9,438.00
200	URLC3 to URLC4 Replacement	\$115,400.00
1	Design, Configuration, Installation Supervision & Testing	\$66,563.00
GRAND TOTAL		\$1,784,902.60

Trapeze Software Group, Inc.

Demand Response On-Board System: Our current vendor for the on-board computer system, Clever Devices, no longer supports this platform, and we are experiencing performance issues as a result. Clever Devices' recommended replacement does not align with our future operational and technology infrastructure goals, and as a result we are currently piloting the replacement system, DriverMate, provided by Trapeze. Trapeze is our existing provider of demand response scheduling and dispatching software, which provides information to the current on-board demand response system. Following the successful completion of the pilot, we are recommending the replacement of the on-board computer system with DriverMate. The DriverMate system will be installed on all 75-demand response vehicles, in addition to 10 spare units. Note, we already have five (5) tablets for the pilot test, and the additional five (5) software licenses are for training and testing, as well as demand response services that may be completed by additional vehicles.

Qty	Description	Total Price
80	Software Licenses	\$72,056.00
1	Installation Services	\$44,857.00
1	Year 1 Maintenance	\$14,411.00
1	90-Day Warranty	Included
1	Optional Training Services	\$7,018.00
1	Optional WVM Implementation Services	\$20,187.00
GRAND TOTAL		\$158,529.00

Ensemble Solutions Group

Qty	Description	Total Price
80	Tablets to Operate DriverMate Software, Tablet Protector, and 1 Year Support Services	\$86,334.40

Tablets: The DriverMate system will be installed on all 75-demand response vehicles, in addition to 10 spare units. Note, we already have five (5) tablets for the pilot test.

Black Bear Radio Inc.

Installation of ITS Upgrade Components: We are already under contract with Black Bear and have the budget to complete all installations under this ITS Upgrade Project Phase 1 of 3. Our existing agreement with Black Bear includes the ability to add projects such as those outlined in this action item. Phases 2 and 3 of the ITS Upgrade Project will have their own associated installation costs.

Qty	Description	Total Price
185	Installation – Fixed Route Vehicles	\$37,000.00
75	Installation – Demand Response Vehicles	\$15,000.00
GRAND TOTAL		\$52,000.00

A cost analysis was performed, and pricing was determined fair and reasonable based on comparison to pricing charged to another transit agency for similar ITS solutions. Long-term maintenance for any new software, integrations or equipment added to the overall ITS platform for all three (3) phases will be included in future contracts to be negotiated with the vendors for annual maintenance.

This procurement will be funded 80% with federal funds, except for Maintenance costs, which will be funded with operating funds.

MOTION made by Mr. Weckesser and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews-Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees contract AWARDS be made to:

- Clever Devices LTD in the total amount of \$1,784,902.60;
- Trapeze Software Group, Inc. in the amount of \$158,529.00;
- Ensemble Solutions Group in the amount of \$86,334.40; and
- Black Bear Radio Inc. in the amount of \$52,000.00.

In addition, a total of \$208,176.60 is recommended for a 10% contingency for all related components, for a grand total award amount of \$2,289,942.60.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio stated the Customer and Business Development Department update was provided in today’s meeting packet.

Ridership Update

Mr. Policicchio shared the ridership update will be made available very soon.

Ohio Transit Risk Pool Special Assessment and Shock Loss Fund Payment

Ms. Stanforth stated the Ohio Transit Risk Pool (OTRP) is an Ohio self-insurance pool organized under Ohio statues established to administer a joint risk pool and purchase insurance. OTRP’s membership includes 15 Regional Transit Authorities.

Annually an independent professional firm performs a Review of Loss and Loss Expense Reserves to assess OTRP's available funds for losses. The review relies on industry benchmarks and OTRP loss experience to estimate ultimate losses. The most recent review concluded that while in total OTRP is well-positioned, Loss Years 2022 - 2024 are underfunded due to higher than anticipated losses. Consequently, in September 2024 OTRP voted to assess members \$1,690,000 with RTA's share equal to \$503,704. RTA's share of the pool is 30% which is based upon factors including population, revenue miles of service, number of vehicles, and property values.

In addition to the Special Assessment the Chief Executive Officer recommends a Shock Loss Fund Contribution of \$930,000. These funds are available from previous Transit Liability amounts earmarked for pre-OTRP deductible payments. As a result, the Shock Loss Fund Contribution will not impact expenses.

The Committees agreed to move this item forward as an action item at the upcoming October 1, 2024 Board of Trustees meeting.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees payments to the Ohio Transit Risk Pool in the amount of \$503,704 for a Special Assessment and \$930,000 for a Shock Loss Fund Contribution. The combined amounts total \$1,433,704.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

July 2024 Financial Report

Ms. Stanforth stated the July 2024 Financial Report was provided in today's meeting packet. Total revenues are \$216 thousand over budget due to higher passenger fares, interest income and sales tax offset by lower federal assistance. Total expenses are \$2.0 million under budget due to lower fringe benefits, services, materials & supplies, casualty & liability and miscellaneous expense. Those positive expense variances are offset by higher purchased transportation. RTA's local capital charge (depreciation) is \$380 thousand under budget. In summary, RTA's service loss is \$600 thousand after seven months, which compares to a budgeted service loss of \$3.2 million. The overall financial result is tracking very favorably as compared to the budget.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Howard stated the Small Purchasing Information was included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions regarding small purchases.

CEO Update

Mr. Ruzinsky provided an update on the RTA Christmas Bus and shared the future vision for the concourse which will become an Interactive Transit Children's Center.

Request for Executive Session

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin to RECESS into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing security concerns.

Roll Call

Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	Excused
Mr. Mullins -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Ms. White -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The MOTION was APPROVED 8-0. The Meeting RECESSED into Executive Session at 9:10 a.m.

Reconvene to Regular Session

MOTION made by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews-Stenson to RECONVENE into Regular Session.

Roll Call

Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	No (left during Executive Session)
Mr. Lumpkin	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	Excused
Mr. Mullins -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Ms. White -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The MOTION was APPROVED 7-0.

The regular meeting RECONVENED at 9:59 a.m.

Next Meeting

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meetings are scheduled for October 15, 2024 and November 19, 2024.

Adjournment

With no further business, the meeting was ADJOURNED by Ms. White at 10:00 a.m.

ATTEST

Sharon D. White, Chair

Brandon Policicchio, Committee Secretary