



**Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes**

November 19, 2024

Members Present: Sharon D. White, Chair
Ashton Dupler
Al Fullenkamp
John A. Lumpkin, Jr.
Belinda Matthews-Stenson
Grady Mullins
David P. Williamson

Excused: Nikol Miller
Thomas Weckesser

Staff in Attendance: Bob Ruzinsky
Roland Caldwell
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall
Julie Hoffman
Deborah Howard
Kristi Newton
Pat O'Malley
Mary K. Stanforth

Mr. Fullenkamp called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. and roll call was taken:

Roll Call

Ms. White -	Excused
Mr. Dupler -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	Excused
Mr. Mullins -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Excused
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of October 22, 2024, Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes

Mr. Fullenkamp asked if attendees request a reading of the minutes or have corrections to the minutes? Upon hearing no requests or corrections, a MOTION was made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson to APPROVE the October 22, 2024 minutes.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 6-0.

Ms. White arrived at the meeting at 8:34 a.m.

December 2024 Board Action Items

Action Item #2 – UPS Battery Backup and Installation Rebid

Mr. O’Malley stated the purpose of this procurement is to award a contract for the replacement of Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority’s (RTA’s) UPS (Uninterrupted Power Supply) battery backup system. This system is located at the 600 Longworth location and it provides backup electrical power in the event of a main power failure. The UPS provides power to the IT Server Room and other critical electrical needs.

This project involves the replacement of 30kW Schneider Electric UPS with a 50kW unit to address additional critical power needs. The awarded contractor will install the new UPS, including any required electrical work, and provide a five (5) year service plan which includes an annual PM and a guaranteed 4-hour response time.

Sealed bids for were solicited though the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Invitations for Bid were sent to thirty-six (36) firms.

At 10:00 AM on October 24, 2024, two (2) bids were received and publicly opened. The bid results were as follows:

GD 24-41R Bid Results	Greensource Distribution Cincinnati, OH	Garber Electric Englewood, OH
UPS Battery Equipment	\$ 81,635.75	\$ 94,802.00
Installation Costs	\$ 27,911.11	**\$127,789.00
5-Year Service Plan	\$ 29,412.50	\$ 40,800.00
Total Bid	\$ 138,959.36	\$ 263,391.00

**Amount includes other materials required for installation and bid bond costs

MOTION made by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a CONTRACT AWARD to Greensource Distribution, Inc. for the UPS battery backup installation for \$109,547 and a five (5) year service plan totaling \$29,413, plus a 10% contingency of \$13,896 for a grand total of \$152,856.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #3 – #2 Ultra Low Sulfur Diesel Fuel

Mr. O’Malley stated RTA uses #2 Ultra Low Sulfur (ULS) fuel daily for the diesel bus fleet and RTA’s non-revenue diesel vehicles.

Vendors were required to base their bids on the Daily OPIS (Oil Price Information Service) Gross #2 Ultra Low Sulfur Distillate Price, Dayton, Ohio, Rack Average plus or minus (+/-) a fixed differential. The differential determines the lowest bidder.

Sealed bids for the purchase of #2 Ultra Low Sulfur fuel for a one-year period with two one-year options were solicited through the Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly, and Transit Talent. Invitations for Bid were sent to 48 vendors.

At 2:00 p.m. on October 10, 2024, nine (9) bids were received and publicly opened. The results were as follows:

GD 24-52 #2 Ultra Low Sulfur Diesel Fuel Bid Tabulation				
Bidders	Base Year Differential OPIS (\$/gal)	Opt YR 1 Differential OPIS (\$/gal)	Opt YR 2 Differential OPIS (\$/gal)	Average 3-YR Differential OPIS (\$/gal)
World Fuel Services, Inc.	-0.0826	-0.0750	-0.0650	-0.0742
Sunoco LP	-0.0609	-0.0584	-0.0559	-0.0584
Petroleum Traders Corporation	-0.0585	-0.0560	-0.0535	-0.0560
Heritage Petroleum, LLC	-0.0572	-0.0551	-0.0530	-0.0551
Mansfield Oil Company of Gainesville	-0.0548	-0.0393	-0.0290	-0.0410
Indigo Energy Partners	-0.0391	-0.0391	-0.0391	-0.0391
Tartan Oil LLC	-0.0302	-0.0302	-0.0302	-0.0302
PS Energy Group, Inc.	-0.0223	-0.0223	-0.0223	-0.0223
Duncan Oil Company	-0.0257	No Bid	No Bid	Not Responsive

Based on the OPIS floating price for #2 Ultra Low Sulfur Fuel for October 10, 2024, and the differential bid by World Fuel Services, Inc., the estimated annual cost is as follows.

**Base Year
(1/1/25-12/31/25)**

Est. Annual Qty. in Gallons	OPIS Floating Price per Gal for 10/10/24	Differential \$/Gal	Price per Gal before Taxes	Federal Environmental Recovery Fee \$/Gal	Ohio Motor Fuel State Tax \$/Gal	Federal Excise Tax (LUST) \$/Gal	*Current Ohio Diesel Petroleum Activity Tax (PAT) \$/Gal	Fed. Haz. Substance Superfund Recovery Fee \$/Gal	Total Cost per Gallon	Total Annual Est. Cost
1,200,000	2.3715	-0.0826	2.2889	0.002143	0.47	0.001	0.016790	0.003905	2.782738	3,339,286

**Option Year 1
(1/1/26-12/31/26)**

Est. Annual Qty. in Gallons	OPIS Floating Price per Gal for 10/10/24	Differential \$/Gal	Price per Gal before Taxes	Federal Environmental Recovery Fee \$/Gal	Ohio Motor Fuel State Tax \$/Gal	Federal Excise Tax (LUST) \$/Gal	*Current Ohio Diesel Petroleum Activity Tax (PAT) \$/Gal	Fed. Haz. Substance Superfund Recovery Fee \$/Gal	Total Cost per Gallon	Total Annual Est. Cost
1,200,000	2.3715	-0.0750	2.2965	0.002143	0.47	0.001	0.016790	0.003906	2.790339	3,348,407

**Option Year 2
(1/1/27-12/31/27)**

Est. Annual Qty. in Gallons	OPIS Floating Price per Gal for 10/10/24	Differential \$/Gal	Price per Gal before Taxes	Federal Environmental Recovery Fee \$/Gal	Ohio Motor Fuel State Tax \$/Gal	Federal Excise Tax (LUST) \$/Gal	*Current Ohio Diesel Petroleum Activity Tax (PAT) \$/Gal	Fed. Haz. Substance Superfund Recovery Fee \$/Gal	Total Cost per Gallon	Total Annual Est. Cost
1,200,000	2.3715	-0.0650	2.3065	0.002143	0.47	0.001	0.016790	0.003905	2.800338	3,360,406

*The Ohio Petroleum Activity Tax changes quarterly based on the statewide average wholesale price of a gallon of diesel fuel, as reported by the Tax Commissioner.

Funding for this procurement is included in the operating budget.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to World Fuel Services, Inc. for #2 Ultra Low Sulfur Diesel Fuel with a differential of -0.0826 for the base year for an estimated \$3,339,286; with a differential of -0.0750 for Option Year 1 for an estimated \$3,348,407 and with a differential of -0.0650 for Option Year 2 for an estimated \$3,360,406 for a total estimated award of \$10,048,099. Actual costs will vary based on the daily OPIS price, the number of gallons purchased, and the quarterly adjustments made to the Ohio Petroleum Activity Tax. The total dollar amount will not exceed the annual budgeted amount in the operating budget.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #4 – On-Site Technical Support

Mr. O'Malley stated the purpose of this procurement is for the RTA to obtain the services of Kiepe Electric, the NexGen trolley manufacturer, to provide on-site technical support services for the NexGen trolley fleet. These services will allow RTA staff to continue to increase their technical capacity and troubleshooting skills for the long-term maintenance and repair of the NexGen Trolley fleet. These services will be supplied over the next two (2) years.

Kiepe Electric has provided this on-site technical support for the past four (4) years, beginning in 2020, when the NexGen warranty period began to expire. Over the past four (4) years, Kiepe Electric has continued to be an integral partner with the RTA's Maintenance Department in keeping the trolleys maintained and serviced in a timely manner to keep the buses safe and operable. They have helped RTA in repairing many issues, including battery issues when the battery manufacturer failed to respond. The service provided by Kiepe Electric allows for immediate attention to service needs and continued technical training for our maintenance crew, resulting in less downtime.

The fees charged will include the following:

- On-Site Support for five (5) days per week (based on a 40-hour week)
- Continued on-the-job-training for RTA shop technicians

A cost analysis was performed on the estimated price of \$452,342. This price includes an approximate daily, hourly rate of \$108.74, which represents a decrease from the prior two (2) year contract of \$466,959.90 at an approximate \$112.25 daily, hourly rate. These rates are based on a forty (40) hour week and will include a replacement technician to cover during the time requested off by our designated technician.

This procurement will be funded with operating funds.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Dupler that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a two (2) year CONTRACT AWARD to Kiepe Electric for \$452,342 for on-site technical support services for RTA's NexGen trolleys.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #5 – Electric Storage Batteries

Mr. O'Malley stated the purpose of this procurement is to award a two (2) year contract with one (1) option year to provide RTA with electric storage batteries on an as needed basis. Annual estimates for each battery type are shown in the table below.

The successful vendor will be responsible for servicing RTA's account and meeting all purchase requirements for the specified period. Requirements include filling battery orders and processing and documenting all warranty battery claims.

Sealed bids for Electric Storage Batteries were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Invitations for Bid were sent to twenty-eight (28) firms.

At 10:00 a.m. on October 17, 2024, three (3) bids were received and publicly opened. The bid results were as follows:

Product Description	Annual Estimates	D&S Auto Parts	Kenworth of Dayton	Worldwide Equipment of Ohio
(Brand or Equal)		(Unit Price)		
YEAR 1				
Deka 7T31	300	\$149.00	*Non-Responsive	**Non-Responsive
Deka 8A31	150	\$289.00	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
Motorcraft BXT-65-750	120	\$128.00	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
YEAR 2				
Deka 7T31	300	\$155.00	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
Deka 8A31	150	\$302.00	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
Motorcraft BXT-65-750	120	\$131.00	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
OPTION YEAR 1				
Deka 7T31	300	\$162.00	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
Deka 8A31	150	\$316.00	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
Motorcraft BXT-65-750	120	\$139.00	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive

* Did not submit specifications nor a request for approved equal for the product they were bidding on.

** Did not complete the required forms and affidavits.

A price analysis was performed and the unit costs provided by D&S Auto Parts are consistent with the unit costs on prior contracts.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a two (2) year CONTRACT AWARD to D&S Auto Parts for electric storage batteries for an estimated amount of \$210,930 with one (1) option year for \$112,680 plus a 10% contingency fee of \$32,361 for any unforeseen battery usage, for a grand total contract award of \$355,971.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #6 – Professional Arborist

Ms. Hoffman stated the purpose of this procurement is for RTA to obtain the services of a Professional Arborist certified by the International Society of Arboriculture (ISA) to provide services related to tree removal, assessment of trees on RTA projects, general tree care, tree plantings, tree replacements, clearance pruning, tree pruning, and emergency response/hazardous conditions. These services would be provided over a five (5) year term.

Proposals for Professional Arborist Services were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly*, and *Transit Talent*. Proposals were sent to 38 firms. At 10:00 a.m. on October 10, 2024, RTA received one (1) proposal.

The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposal using the following criteria:

- Services Offered
- Qualifications
- Cost
- Past Performance
- References and General Qualifications of Personnel

The submitted proposal:

**Tree Care, Inc.
Dayton, OH**

Service	Pricing (Per Man-hour)
Complete Tree & Stump Removal & Grinding for Trees under 24" dbh	\$145.00
Tree Planting for 15 Gallon Tree	\$125.00
Emergency Response by a Three Person Crew with Equipment (Evenings, Weekends, or Holidays)	Per man-hour \$185.00 3-man crew \$555.00
Clearance Pruning	\$135.00
Tree Watering Services	\$110.00
Pest Treatment per Tree	\$125.00
Tree Inventory including Care or Removal Recommendations	\$145.00
Master Arborist or Certified Arborist Utility Specialist Hourly Fee	BMCA \$145.00 CA \$125.00

As indicated, only one (1) proposal was received. Tree Care, Inc. is the firm currently used by RTA for Professional Arborist Services. After contacting the firms that were sent the Request for Proposals, the responses were that they were overbooked, and others overlooked the advertisement of the RFP.

RTA has been satisfied with the services received from Tree Care, Inc. The references that RTA surveyed stated the following. Tree Care, Inc. was used for over 19 years, if any mistakes were made, they were minimal and handled in a timely manner. They are an excellent company with good customer service. One firm used Tree Care, Inc. for the cleanup of the 2019 Memorial Day tornado. They are said to be an extremely professional company and always perform fabulous work. Safety is a core value for Tree Care; all the staff performs their work in a very safe manner, wearing appropriate PPE, using appropriate equipment for the job, all the while ensuring the safety of the people and property around them. They have completed very complex tasks including extensive work along US 35 that required significant traffic control and lane closures with the staff being well trained in uniform traffic safety standards.

A cost analysis was performed that found the pricing to be fair and reasonable. Tree Care raised the cost of three (3) items from the last time by 11% - 32% because the company forecasted increased rates over the five (5) year period. RTA has a line item for Tree Watering Services that was not included in the RFP in 2019. This watering was included in two (2) of the other items which resulted in them decreasing the costs of these items between 12% - 32%. Furthermore, research revealed that tree removals in the Dayton area range from \$200-\$2,000, planting trees cost an average of \$425, and pest treatment is estimated between \$250-\$600.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a CONTRACT AWARD to Tree Care, Inc. for a five (5) year period based on the hourly rates stated above for services that are determined needed for a total of \$890,000. In addition, a contingency fee of 10% (\$89,000) is recommended to provide tree planting and related services for anticipated upcoming facilities projects, for a total not to exceed \$979,000. Funds for Professional Arborist Services are included in the operating budget.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #7 – 2025 Meeting Schedule

Mr. Ruzinsky explained that as set forth in the Greater Dayton RTA Bylaws, the Board of Trustees Meeting Dates occur on the first Tuesday of each month. The Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting dates typically occur on the third Tuesday of each month. The Investment Advisory Committee meets quarterly on the third Thursday during the months of January, April, July, and October.

On an infrequent basis it is necessary to change a regularly scheduled meeting date. After a comprehensive review of planned Agency activities, the attached 2025 Board and Committees meeting dates are recommended for approval by the Board of Trustees.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of the presented 2025 Board and Committees meeting dates.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #8 – Administrative Compensation Guide

Mr. Ruzinsky explained that the RTA has an Administrative Employee Compensation Guide for non-union employees. Periodically, if not annually, the Compensation Guide is reviewed and adjusted. A recommendation has been made to the Chief Executive Officer to adjust the current Compensation Guide across the board by 3%. There are no implied or expressed guarantees on wage increases.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. White that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of the presented 2025 Administrative Employee Compensation Guide.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Customer and Business Development Updates

Ms. Newton highlighted the various activities taking place in the Customer and Business Development Department. Ms. Newton also detailed Agency wide 2024 departmental accomplishments. The written update was included in today's meeting materials.

September 2024 Financial Report

Ms. Stanforth stated the September 2024 Financial Report was provided in today's meeting packet. Total revenues are \$89 thousand over budget as a result of higher passenger fares and sales tax, offset by lower federal assistance. Total expenses are \$2.7 million under budget as a result of lower paid absences and fringe benefits, services, materials & supplies as well as miscellaneous expense, offset by higher purchased transportation. RTA's service loss after local capital charge is \$958 thousand after nine months, which compares to a budgeted loss of \$4.1 million. The overall financial result is tracking favorably compared to budget.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Howard stated the Small Purchasing Information was included in today's meeting packet.

Chief Executive Officer Update

Mr. Ruzinsky provided an update on the upcoming Maintenance Department Open House, Wright Stop Plaza parking lot closure the day after Thanksgiving, and election results possible impact to RTA funding.

Request for Executive Session

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp to RECESS into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing Real Estate.

ROLL CALL was taken:

Mr. Dupler -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	No
Mr. Mullins-	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	No
Ms. White -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The MOTION was APPROVED 7-0.

The meeting RECESSED into Executive Session at 9:05 a.m.

Reconvene to Regular Session

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp to RECONVENE into Regular Session.

ROLL CALL was taken:

Mr. Dupler -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	No
Mr. Mullins-	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	No
Ms. White -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The MOTION was APPROVED 7-0.

The regular meeting RECONVENED at 9:28 a.m.

Next Meeting

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committee meeting is tentatively scheduled for December 17, 2024.

Adjournment

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. White to ADJOURN the meeting.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

The meeting ADJOURNED at 9:30 a.m.

ATTEST



Sharon D. White, Chair



Mary Kay Stanforth, Committee Secretary